

COMMITTEE REPORT

Committee: West/Centre Area **Ward:** Guildhall
Date: 16 September 2008 **Parish:** Guildhall Planning Panel

Reference: 08/01647/FULM
Application at: Monkbar Hotel St Maurices Road York YO31 7JA
For: Four storey extension to rear to create additional bedrooms and conference rooms and alterations to existing hotel
By: Mr Rishi Sachden
Application Type: Major Full Application (13 weeks)
Target Date: 13 October 2008

1.0 PROPOSAL

Application site

1.1 The application relates to Monkbar Hotel, which occupies the corner of Monkgate and St Maurice's Road. The hotel currently has 99 guest rooms and 8 conference rooms. The facilities are located within the main building, above ground floor level at 18, 20, 22, 24, and 26 Monkgate, at the lodge building (which fronts St Maurice's Road) and in the three two-storey outbuildings/garage blocks to the north and east of the main building.

1.2 The main building is 3.5-storey in height of brick, slate roof and lead dormers. It was first granted permission in the 1980's and was extended in the 1990's. The building is not listed but is in the Central Historic Core Conservation Area.

1.3 The site is surrounded by houses to the north and east; Monkgate Cloisters to the north is three-storey, of a similar design to the hotel. To the east housing on St Maurice's Road and Cloisters Walk is three/two storey in height.

1.4 Nearby grade II listed buildings are the public house (Keystones) on the corner of St Maurice's Road and Goodramgate and at 28 Monkgate, which is commercial/residential. The city walls are also around 45m south of the application site.

Proposal

1.5 The application is for planning permission to add 30 guest bedrooms and 1 conference room. Four of the guestrooms would be in the existing garage block (c) located at the north of the site, otherwise the new facilities would be within a proposed extension in the centre of the site. The extension would have a footprint of 12 by 12.5 metres, with an extra 1m by 3.6m for the associated stairwell. In height, materials, shape and detailing it would replicate the main building. It is also proposed to re-configure the car parking layout on site, the number of car parking spaces on-site would be reduced from 43 to 36. Double height car storage places would be accommodated in two of the garage blocks (a & c). A coach parking space is retained within the site.

Relevant site history

1.6 In January 2001 planning permission was granted for an extension to the hotel on a similar footprint/scale to that proposed in this application. The permission was for a pool/leisure facility at ground floor level and 25 guest rooms above. There would have been 43 car parking spaces available and 20-25 cycle parking spaces, the latter in two dedicated cycle stores.

2.0 POLICY CONTEXT

2.1 Development Plan Allocation:

Areas of Archaeological Interest City Centre Area 0006

Conservation Area Central Historic Core 0038

City Boundary York City Boundary 0001

DC Area Teams Central Area 0002

Listed Buildings Grade 2; Monkbar Hotel 28 Monkgate York YO31 7PF 0932

2.2 Policies:

CYGP1	Design
CYHE3	Conservation Areas
CYHE2	Development in historic locations
CYV3	Criteria for hotels and guest houses
CYHE10	Archaeology

3.0 CONSULTATIONS

Internal

Design, Conservation and Sustainable Development

3.1 The application site concerns a large hotel, which has a historic frontage onto Monkgate and contemporary development extending back from St Maurice's Road. The application proposes an extension to the existing contemporary development.

3.2 The proposal was the subject of pre-application advice earlier this year and appears to have been submitted in accordance with the advice given. At pre-application stage it was suggested that soft landscaping measures/planting in the car park area would soften the impact of the development in terms of impact on the character and appearance of the conservation area. The Applicants appear to have addressed this with proposed planting to the forecourt of the hotel.

3.3 The development has been designed to replicate the existing building and the materials specification contained on drawing no. AL(0)042 details materials to match existing. The wide visibility splay to St Maurice's Road means that the site is very visible from the conservation area. Generally, the neighbouring developments to the proposed extension are contemporary and are of varying heights but generally, three to four stories. The proposed development will therefore not be out of keeping its surrounds.

Environmental Protection Unit

3.4 Requested a noise assessment to assess the impact of the car storage system, as noise from such may affect guests and surrounding occupants. Also ask for conditions to be attached regarding investigation into any contamination of the site and subsequent remediation requirements.

Highway Network Management

3.5 There was originally concern that the relocated coach parking bay (when proposed at the front entrance to the site) was not provided with a turning circle within the site. As such it would need to perform such a manoeuvre in the highway. St Maurice's Road forms part of the inner ring road and vehicles turning etc in the road here would be harmful to the flow of traffic and detrimental to highway safety. It was requested that the coach parking space be relocated, and provided with a turning circle onsite.

3.6 Due to the location of the site (close to the city centre and transport links) a shortfall in parking provision would not be objected to.

3.7 The subsequently revised layout (drawing 005G) was deemed to be acceptable in terms of the coach parking and turning arrangements. However the proposed cycle storage is only capable of readily holding 12 bicycles, and therefore it is recommended that additional cycle storage for 2 bikes be provided.

Sustainability Officer

3.8 Ask for a condition to require that the scheme achieves a BREEAM 'very good' rating.

External

Planning Panel

3.9 Pending.

English Heritage

3.10 No comment. Ask that the decision be made considering relevant policy and conservation officer advice.

Safer York Partnership

3.11 Suggest the use of CCTV for the car park. Between July 2007 and 2008 there were 24 recorded crimes within a 50m radius of the site, 7 of these related to 'auto-crime' (6 incidents of theft from a vehicle, 1 of vehicle theft).

Visit York

3.12 Pending.

York Drainage Consultancy

3.13 Make the following points and advise that these measures will need to be agreed to by the applicants, they would then be conditions were the application approved.

- The applicant should provide a topographical survey and proposed finished floor and ground levels, to ensure that there will not be any detriment to the drainage of existing properties.
- Additional surface water shall not be connected to any foul / combined sewer, if a suitable surface water sewer or watercourse is available.
- In accordance with PPS25 and in agreement with the Environment Agency and Marston Moor Internal Drainage Board, peak run-off from brown-field sites must be attenuated to 70% of the existing rate. Storage volume calculations, using computer modelling, must accommodate a 1:30 year storm with no surface flooding, along with no internal flooding of buildings or surface run-off from the site in a 1:100 year storm. Proposed areas within the model must also include an additional 20% allowance for climate change. The modelling must use a range of storm durations, with both summer and winter profiles, to find the worst-case volume required.

Publicity (site notice, neighbour notification and press notice)

3.14 The deadline given for comment was 20 August. 7 objections to date have been received. Comments are as follows -

Highway safety related

- There will be limited access/space for servicing. Comments relate to glass/waste collections, as well as visitors vehicles.
- Limited car parking given the increase in rooms. This will increase noise levels and demand for parking in the surrounding streets. St Maurice's Road is already a busy street, it is part of the inner ring road, and cars struggle to park at the hotel site. The scheme will thus be detrimental to highway safety.
- Suggest that the hotel offer incentives for guests whom do not use a private motor vehicle.
- Coaches attempting to park will create noise and air pollution.

Visual and residential amenity

- The extension would lead to a loss of privacy to the occupants of the dwellings in Monkgate Cloisters.
- Loss of value to houses in Monkgate Cloisters
- The landscaping scheme is unrealistic, as there is inadequate space for trees between car parking spaces.
- The extension is too high/dominant, it constitutes overdevelopment of the site and would harm the appearance of the area.

4.0 APPRAISAL

Key issues

4.1 The key issues are as follows:

- Principle
- Design and visual impact on the surrounding area

- Amenity of surrounding occupants
- Highway safety
- Sustainability
- Flood risk

Principle

4.2 Policy V3 of the Local Plan states planning permission will be granted for extensions to existing premises provided the proposal:

- Is compatible with its surroundings in terms of siting, scale and design.
- Would not result in the loss of residential accommodation which when originally built had less than four bedrooms.
- Would not have an adverse effect on the residential character of the area.
- Is well related in terms of walking, cycling and access to public transport in relation to York City Centre or other visitor attractions.

4.3 In terms of design and location the site is considered appropriate for a hotel expansion. Design and amenity is covered in more depth in paragraphs 4.6-4.7 and 4.9-4.12. The extension does not involve the loss of housing. Overall it is considered the extension accords to policy V3 and is thus acceptable in principle.

Design and visual impact on the surrounding area

4.4 GP1 Refers to design, for all types of development. It states that development proposals will be expected to, respect or enhance the local environment; be of a density, layout, scale, mass and design that is compatible with the surrounding area; use appropriate materials; avoid the loss of open spaces, vegetation and other features which contribute to the quality of the local environment; retain, enhance, or create urban spaces; provide and protect amenity space; provide space for waste storage; ensure no undue adverse impact from noise disturbance, overlooking, overshadowing or from overdominant structures.

4.5 The site is within a designated conservation area (Central Historic Core). Within such areas, the Council has a statutory duty to consider the desirability of preserving or enhancing the character and appearance of the area. Policies HE2 and HE3 of the Local Plan are relevant in this respect. HE2 states that within conservation areas, or locations which affect the setting of listed buildings development proposals must respect adjacent buildings, open spaces, landmarks and settings and have regards to local scale, proportions, details and materials. Proposals will be required to maintain or enhance existing urban spaces, views, landmarks and other townscape elements, which contribute to the character or appearance of the area. Policy HE3 states that within Conservation Areas, proposals will only be permitted where there is no adverse effect on the character or appearance of the area.

The extension

4.6 The proposed extension by virtue of its design - size, height, materials and detailing would compliment the main hotel building and the surrounding housing such as Monkgate Cloisters, which are of similar style and design to the hotel. The development respects it's setting, and is of reasonable appearance; it would preserve the appearance of the conservation area.

4.7 The development would block a vista of mature trees, with the bar walls behind from some of the houses on Monkgate Cloisters. The extension would be some 55m from the city walls and 37m from the rear elevation from the Monkgate Cloisters houses. Due to the separation distances and the (considered) appropriate height of the proposed extension, it is considered that the loss of this view would not be contrary to policy HE2 which seeks to 'maintain views, landmarks and other townscape elements'. Of more importance (in planning terms) is that views, setting and openness from the public realm would not be adversely affected, as this is the thrust of policy SP3 of the Local Plan which relates to safeguarding the historic character, setting and distinct environment of the centre of York.

The landscaping

4.8 The layout has been revised, and the coach parking space has been relocated from the front entrance of the site, to its previous/existing location toward the rear of the site, between garage blocks A and B. Also the disabled parking bays have been amended at the other side of the main entrance, so they have a shared access strip (which is acceptable to Highway Network Management). These amendments allow for significantly more soft landscaping/planting to the front entrance of the site. This softens the appearance of the car park and enhances the appearance of the conservation area.

Amenity of surrounding occupants

4.9 Amenity is covered in policy GP1 that advises that developments should not lead to undue adverse impact from noise disturbance, overlooking, overshadowing or from overdominant structures.

4.10 The extension would, at its nearest point, be 10m from the back garden of 1 Cloisters Walk to the east and 31m from houses to the north (Monkgate Cloisters). Facing east there would be a bedroom window on the end elevation at second floor level overlooking the houses' rear garden. Separation distances between rear elevations and back gardens are commonly around 12-14m between units on Cloisters Walk, where buildings are either 2 or 3 storey in height. A distance of 10m is generally considered adequate, in terms of what is appropriate from a window into a garden. Overall it is considered the separation distances proposed are reasonable for a city centre location, where an element of overlooking is to be expected. Also accordingly, and because of the proposed extension's height, the building would not be unduly overbearing or overdominant.

4.11 Noise levels associated with the proposed vehicle stacking system are required to make sure it would not cause disturbance when in use. The stacking system would be located below guestrooms in garage block c, and in close proximity to houses at 1 and 14 Cloisters Walk.

4.12 Condition 8 asks for noise levels of the system. If there were unresolved concerns, the stacking system could be omitted from the proposal, potentially reducing the amount of car parking spaces to 26. Highway Network Management have confirmed they would accept the amount of car parking, should this occur.

Highway safety

4.13 T4 seeks to promote cycling and states that all new development should provide storage for cycles in accordance with the standards in appendix E of the Local Plan.

4.14 A covered cycle parking store is provided within the site for staff. This can accommodate around 12 - 14 cycle parking spaces. According to the Local Plan a minimum of 13 spaces should be provided for a development of this size (1 space per 10 bedrooms). It is suggested a condition requires details of the cycle storage as the space allocated is limited and preferably more space, not the minimum requirement, would be dedicated to cycle storage (around 20 spaces).

4.15 36 car parking spaces are provided on site, which Highway Network Management feel is more than adequate due to the proximity of the site to the city centre and public car parking spaces.

4.16 The coach parking space has been moved back to its existing location, this enables it to turn within the site, thus not blocking St Maurice's Road. As such the development will not affect highway safety.

Sustainability

4.17 It is a requirement of policy GP4a of the Local Plan that a sustainability statement is submitted. The proposed development should meet the requirements of the Council's planning guidance Interim Planning Statement (IPS) on Sustainable Design and Construction, which was adopted for development control purposes on 22.11.07. For commercial developments which involve the creation of 500 sq m + floorspace, it is a requirement that the scheme achieves a BREEAM standard of very good.

4.18 A preliminary BREEAM assessment has been carried out by the applicants which advise that a BREEAM rating of very good could be achieved (score of 55.4% gained, 55% minimum for very good). The requirement that a very good rating could be secured through a planning condition (condition 3). There is scope to improve the preliminary score through producing a travel plan, use of water butts, improving recycling arrangements, and possibly incorporating renewable energy technology.

4.19 A condition is suggested to clarify where the dedicated waste and recycling stores are located, to ensure that they are provided and that they are visually acceptable.

Flood risk

4.20 The site is not in a flood risk area. However to ensure the risk of flooding elsewhere is not enhanced, the conditions requested by the Drainage Consultancy, in paragraph 3.12 can be attached to any permission.

5.0 CONCLUSION

5.1 It is considered the development is in accordance with policy. The extension would appear acceptable and would not harm residential amenity. The development

would be sustainable and there would be no undue impact on highway safety and flood risk.

5.2 Conditions are suggested to ensure amenity is controlled in terms of the vehicle stacking system and details of the bin stores and landscaping. There are also conditions relating to sustainability and the provision/design of cycle stores.

COMMITTEE TO VISIT

6.0 RECOMMENDATION: Approve

1 TIME2 Development start within three years

2 The development hereby permitted shall be carried out only in accordance with the following plans:-

S6301/AL (0)

005G

006

007

008

041

042

or any plans or details subsequently agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority as amendment to the approved plans.

Reason: For the avoidance of doubt and to ensure that the development is carried out only as approved by the Local Planning Authority.

3 Prior to occupation of the building hereby approved the developer shall submit in writing a formal BREEAM assessment or equivalent, for the Design and Procurement stages for the building hereby approved. All assessments shall be followed by a BREEAM Post Construction review to be submitted after construction at a time to be agreed in writing by the local planning authority. All assessments shall confirm the minimum 'Very Good' rating, or equivalent, anticipated in the preliminary BREEAM assessment submitted with the application, and be agreed to in writing by the local planning authority.

Reason: In the interests of sustainable development, in accordance with the requirements of policy GP4a of the Draft Local Plan and the Council's planning guidance Interim Planning Statement (IPS) on Sustainable Design and Construction.

4 The materials to be used externally shall match those of the existing main hotel building in colour, size, shape and texture, as shown on drawing 042.

Reason: To achieve a visually acceptable form of development.

5 No development shall take place until there has been submitted and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority a detailed landscaping scheme which shall

illustrate the number, species, height and position of trees and shrubs to be planted and/or retained.

This scheme shall be implemented within a period of six months of the completion of the development. Any trees or plants which within a period of five years from the completion of the development die, are removed or become seriously damaged or diseased shall be replaced in the next planting season with others of a similar size and species, unless alternatives are agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority.

Reason: So that the Local Planning Authority may be satisfied with the variety, suitability and disposition of species within the site.

6 Prior to development commencing details of the storage space for recyclable materials shall be approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority and retained for such use at all times, unless an alternative arrangement is agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority.

Reason: To encourage recycling and to maintain visual amenity in accordance with policies GP1 and GP4a of the CYC Local Plan.

7 Prior to the development commencing details of the cycle parking areas, including means of enclosure, shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. The development hereby approved shall not be occupied until the cycle parking areas and means of enclosure have been provided within the site in accordance with such approved details, and these areas shall not be used for any purpose other than the parking of cycles.

Reason: To promote use of cycles thereby reducing congestion on the adjacent roads and in the interests of the amenity of neighbours.

Informative

The details must demonstrate there is adequate space for at least 14 cycles (and preferably 20). It is considered that the cycle parking allocation as shown on drawing 005G is inadequate as this would not accommodate the minimum requirement.

8 Prior to installation of the vehicle stacking system, details of all machinery, plant and equipment to be installed and any proposed noise mitigation measures shall be submitted to the local planning authority. These details shall include maximum (LA_{max(f)}) and average (LA_{eq}) sound levels (A weighted), and octave band noise levels they produce. All such machinery, plant and equipment shall not be used on the site except in accordance with the prior written approval of the local planning authority. The machinery, plant or equipment and any approved noise mitigation measures shall be appropriately maintained thereafter.

Reason: In the interests of the amenity of the surrounding occupants and of the hotel.

Informative

You are reminded that should the required details demonstrate that the system would be unacceptable, then it may not be installed.

9 Prior to development commencing the following details shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. The development shall commence in accordance with the approved details.

- A topographical survey and proposed finished floor and ground levels. To ensure that there will not be any detriment to the drainage of existing properties.

- Demonstrate that peak run-off from the site shall be attenuated to 70% of the existing rate. This should include storage volume calculations, using computer modelling, which must accommodate a 1:30 year storm with no surface flooding, along with no internal flooding of buildings or surface run-off from the site in a 1:100 year storm. Proposed areas within the model must also include an additional 20% allowance for climate change. The modelling must use a range of storm durations, with both summer and winter profiles, to find the worst-case volume required.

Reason: To reduce flood risk, in accordance with PPS25 and in agreement with the Environment Agency and Marston Moor Internal Drainage Board.

10 Additional surface water shall not be connected to any foul / combined sewer, if a suitable surface water sewer or watercourse is available.

Reason: In the interests of mitigating flood risk, in accordance with policy GP15a of the Local Plan.

11 ARCH2 Archaeological watching brief required

12 HWAY14 Access to be approved, details required

13 A desk study shall be undertaken in order to identify any potentially contaminative uses which have or are currently occurring on the site. This shall include a site description and a site walkover and shall be submitted to and approved by the local planning authority prior to development commencing at the site.

Informative: This should where possible date back to 1800.

Reason: For the protection of human health and the wider environment.

14 A site investigation shall be undertaken based upon the findings of the desk study. The investigation shall be carried out in accordance with BS10175: Investigation of potentially contaminated land: code of practice. The results of the investigation shall be submitted to and approved by the local planning authority in writing prior to any development commencing on the site.

Reason: For the protection of human health and the wider environment.

15 A risk-based remedial strategy shall be developed based on the findings of the site investigation. The remedial strategy shall be submitted to and approved by

the local planning authority in writing. The approved strategy shall be fully implemented prior to any development commencing at the site.

Informative: The remedial strategy shall have due regard for UK adopted policy on risk assessment and shall be developed in full consultation with the appropriate regulator(s).

Reason: For the protection of human health and the wider environment.

16 A validation report shall be submitted to and approved by the local planning authority, detailing sample locations and contaminant concentrations prior to any development commencing at the site.

Reason: For the protection of human health and the wider environment.

17 Any contamination detected during site works that has not been considered within the remedial strategy shall be reported to the local planning authority. Any remediation for this contamination shall be agreed with the local planning authority and fully implemented prior to any further development at the site.

Reason: For the protection of human health and the wider environment.

7.0 INFORMATIVES: Notes to Applicant

1. INFORMATIVE:

You are advised that prior to starting on site consent will be required from the Highway Authority for the works being proposed, under the Highways Act 1980 (unless alternatively specified under the legislation or Regulations listed below). For further information please contact the officer named:

Section 62 - General Power of Improvement (Mr Michael Kitchen Tel:1336)

Section 184 - Vehicle Crossing (Mr Stuart Partington Tel: 551361)

Your attention is drawn to the Safer York Partnership comments which suggest that CCTV systems be installed to monitor the car park.

2. REASON FOR APPROVAL

In the opinion of the Local Planning Authority the proposal, subject to the conditions listed above, would not cause undue harm to interests of acknowledged importance, with particular reference to the character and appearance of the conservation area, residential amenity, highway safety and flood risk. As such the proposal complies with Policies HE2, HE3, HE10 GP1 and V3 of the City of York Local Plan Deposit Draft.

3. The developer's attention should also be drawn to the various requirements for the control of noise on construction sites laid down in the Control of Pollution Act 1974. In order to ensure that residents are not adversely affected by air pollution

and noise, the following guidance should be attached to any planning approval, failure to do so could result in formal action being taken under the Control of Pollution Act 1974:

- All demolition and construction works and ancillary operations, including deliveries to and despatch from the site shall be confined to the following hours:

Monday to Friday	08.00 to 18.00
Saturday	09.00 to 13.00
Not at all on Sundays and Bank Holidays.	

- The work shall be carried out in such a manner so as to comply with the general recommendations of British Standards BS 5228: Part 1: 1997, a code of practice for "Noise and Vibration Control on Construction and Open Sites" and in particular Section 10 of Part 1 of the code entitled "Control of noise and vibration".

- All plant and machinery to be operated, sited and maintained in order to minimise disturbance. All items of machinery powered by internal combustion engines must be properly silenced and/or fitted with effective and well-maintained mufflers in accordance with manufacturers instructions.

- The best practicable means, as defined by Section 72 of the Control of Pollution Act 1974, shall be employed at all times, in order to minimise noise emissions.

- All reasonable measures shall be employed in order to control and minimise dust emissions, including sheeting of vehicles and use of water for dust suppression.

- There shall be no bonfires on the site.

Contact details:

Author: Jonathan Kenyon Development Control Officer

Tel No: 01904 551323